

### Solution to Homework Assignment No. 3

1. First, we apply elimination to transform  $\mathbf{A}$  into the reduced row echelon (RRE) form:

$$\mathbf{A} = \begin{bmatrix} 0 & 1 & 2 & 3 & 4 \\ 0 & 1 & 2 & 4 & 6 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 2 \end{bmatrix} \implies \mathbf{R} = \begin{bmatrix} 0 & 1 & 2 & 0 & -2 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 2 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 \end{bmatrix}.$$

We can have  $\mathbf{R} = \mathbf{EA}$ , where

$$\mathbf{E} = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 0 & -3 \\ -1 & 1 & 0 \\ 1 & -1 & 1 \end{bmatrix}.$$

A basis for the row space is given by

$$\beta_{\text{row}} = \left\{ \begin{bmatrix} 0 \\ 1 \\ 2 \\ 0 \\ -2 \end{bmatrix}, \begin{bmatrix} 0 \\ 0 \\ 0 \\ 1 \\ 2 \end{bmatrix} \right\}.$$

Since columns 2 and 4 are the pivot columns of  $\mathbf{R}$ , we know in class that a basis for the column space can be formed by columns 2 and 4 of  $\mathbf{A}$ , i.e.,

$$\beta_{\text{column}} = \left\{ \begin{bmatrix} 1 \\ 1 \\ 0 \end{bmatrix}, \begin{bmatrix} 3 \\ 4 \\ 1 \end{bmatrix} \right\}.$$

On the other hand, the vectors in the nullspace satisfy

$$\begin{bmatrix} 0 & 1 & 2 & 0 & -2 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 2 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} x_1 \\ x_2 \\ x_3 \\ x_4 \\ x_5 \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} 0 \\ 0 \\ 0 \end{bmatrix}.$$

Since  $x_2, x_4$  are pivot variables and  $x_1, x_3, x_5$  are free variables, a basis for the nullspace can be given by the three special solutions:

$$\beta_{\text{null}} = \left\{ \begin{bmatrix} 1 \\ 0 \\ 0 \\ 0 \\ 0 \end{bmatrix}, \begin{bmatrix} 0 \\ -2 \\ 1 \\ 0 \\ 0 \end{bmatrix}, \begin{bmatrix} 0 \\ 2 \\ 0 \\ -2 \\ 1 \end{bmatrix} \right\}.$$

Finally, since the last row of  $\mathbf{R}$  is a zero row, a basis for the left nullspace can be given by the last row of  $\mathbf{E}$ :

$$\beta_{\text{left}} = \left\{ \begin{bmatrix} 1 \\ -1 \\ 1 \end{bmatrix} \right\}.$$

2. (a) Let  $\mathbf{A}$ ,  $\mathbf{B}$ ,  $\mathbf{C}$  be  $n \times n$  matrices with  $\mathbf{a}_k$ ,  $\mathbf{b}_k$ , and  $\mathbf{c}_k$  denoting the  $k$ th row of  $\mathbf{A}$ ,  $\mathbf{B}$ , and  $\mathbf{C}$ , respectively. Now since  $\mathbf{C} = \mathbf{A}\mathbf{B}$ , we have

$$\mathbf{c}_i = \mathbf{a}_i \mathbf{B} = \sum_{j=1}^n a_{ij} \mathbf{b}_j \quad \text{for any } 1 \leq i \leq n$$

which shows that the rows of  $\mathbf{C}$  are linear combinations of the rows of  $\mathbf{B}$ . Therefore, it follows that

$$\mathbf{c}_i^T \in \mathcal{C}(\mathbf{B}^T) \quad \text{for any } 1 \leq i \leq n. \quad (1)$$

On the other hand, the rank of  $\mathbf{C}$  is the maximum number of linearly independent rows in  $\mathbf{C}$ , which of course cannot exceed the dimension of  $\mathcal{C}(\mathbf{B}^T)$  because of (1). As a result, we have

$$\text{rank}(\mathbf{C}) \leq \dim(\mathcal{C}(\mathbf{B}^T)) = \text{rank}(\mathbf{B}).$$

- (b) From  $\mathbf{C} = \mathbf{A}\mathbf{B}$  we may obtain  $\mathbf{C}^T = \mathbf{B}^T \mathbf{A}^T$  by taking transpose on both sides. It now follows from part (a) that

$$\text{rank}(\mathbf{C}^T) \leq \text{rank}(\mathbf{A}^T).$$

Together with the fact that

$$\text{rank}(\mathbf{C}) = \text{rank}(\mathbf{C}^T) \quad \text{and} \quad \text{rank}(\mathbf{A}^T) = \text{rank}(\mathbf{A})$$

we finally arrive at

$$\text{rank}(\mathbf{C}) = \text{rank}(\mathbf{C}^T) \leq \text{rank}(\mathbf{A}^T) = \text{rank}(\mathbf{A}).$$

3. (a) Let

$$\mathbf{A} \triangleq \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 2 & 2 & 3 \\ 1 & 3 & 3 & 2 \end{bmatrix}$$

so that  $S = \mathcal{C}(\mathbf{A}^T)$ . In class we know that

$$S^\perp = \mathcal{C}(\mathbf{A}^T)^\perp = \mathcal{N}(\mathbf{A}).$$

Hence we solve the system of linear equations:

$$\begin{bmatrix} 1 & 2 & 2 & 3 \\ 1 & 3 & 3 & 2 \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} x_1 \\ x_2 \\ x_3 \\ x_4 \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} 0 \\ 0 \end{bmatrix}$$

which leads to two vectors  $(0, -1, 1, 0)$  and  $(-5, 1, 0, 1)$  spanning  $S^\perp$ .

- (b) Let

$$\mathbf{B} \triangleq [ 1 \ 1 \ 1 \ 1 ]$$

so that  $P = \mathcal{N}(\mathbf{B})$ . We also learn in class that

$$P^\perp = \mathcal{N}(\mathbf{B})^\perp = \mathcal{C}(\mathbf{B}^T).$$

Since  $\mathbf{B}$  contains a single row, we know that  $(1, 1, 1, 1)$  is a basis for  $P^\perp$ .

4. Applying elimination to the system of linear equations

$$\begin{bmatrix} 1 & 0 & 2 \\ 1 & 1 & 4 \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} x_1 \\ x_2 \\ x_3 \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} 0 \\ 0 \end{bmatrix}$$

leads to a basis for  $\mathcal{N}(\mathbf{A})$  given by  $\mathbf{w} = (-2, -2, 1)^T$ . The orthogonality between  $\mathbf{w}$  and  $\mathcal{C}(\mathbf{A}^T)$  can be verified by

$$\begin{bmatrix} 1 & 0 & 2 \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} -2 \\ -2 \\ 1 \end{bmatrix} = 0 \quad \text{and} \quad \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 1 & 4 \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} -2 \\ -2 \\ 1 \end{bmatrix} = 0.$$

To split  $\mathbf{x} = (3, 3, 3)^T$  into  $\mathbf{x}_r + \mathbf{x}_n$ , we first project  $\mathbf{x}$  onto  $\mathcal{N}(\mathbf{A})$  so that

$$\mathbf{x}_n = \frac{\mathbf{w}^T \mathbf{x}}{\mathbf{w}^T \mathbf{w}} \mathbf{w} = -\mathbf{w} = \begin{bmatrix} 2 \\ 2 \\ -1 \end{bmatrix}.$$

Finally, it follows that

$$\mathbf{x}_r = \mathbf{x} - \mathbf{x}_n = \begin{bmatrix} 3 \\ 3 \\ 3 \end{bmatrix} - \begin{bmatrix} 2 \\ 2 \\ -1 \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} 1 \\ 1 \\ 4 \end{bmatrix}.$$

5. (a) In class we know the projection of  $\mathbf{b}$  onto the column space of  $\mathbf{A}$  is given by

$$\mathbf{p} = \mathbf{A}\hat{\mathbf{x}} \tag{2}$$

where  $\hat{\mathbf{x}}$  is the solution to

$$\mathbf{A}^T \mathbf{A} \hat{\mathbf{x}} = \mathbf{A}^T \mathbf{b}. \tag{3}$$

In our case, (3) is explicitly given by

$$\begin{bmatrix} 2 & 1 \\ 1 & 1 \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} \hat{x}_1 \\ \hat{x}_2 \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} 5 \\ 2 \end{bmatrix}$$

and hence

$$\hat{\mathbf{x}} = \begin{bmatrix} \hat{x}_1 \\ \hat{x}_2 \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} 3 \\ -1 \end{bmatrix}.$$

It now follows from (2) that

$$\mathbf{p} = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 1 \\ 0 & 0 \\ 1 & 0 \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} 3 \\ -1 \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} 2 \\ 0 \\ 3 \end{bmatrix}$$

and the error is thus

$$\mathbf{e} = \mathbf{b} - \mathbf{p} = \begin{bmatrix} 2 \\ 4 \\ 3 \end{bmatrix} - \begin{bmatrix} 2 \\ 0 \\ 3 \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} 0 \\ 4 \\ 0 \end{bmatrix}.$$

The orthogonality between  $\mathbf{e}$  and the columns of  $\mathbf{A}$  can be verified by

$$\begin{bmatrix} 1 & 0 & 1 \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} 0 \\ 4 \\ 0 \end{bmatrix} = 0 \quad \text{and} \quad \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 0 & 0 \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} 0 \\ 4 \\ 0 \end{bmatrix} = 0.$$

(b) Applying (3) and (2) we obtain

$$\hat{\mathbf{x}} = \begin{bmatrix} -2 \\ 6 \end{bmatrix} \quad \text{and} \quad \mathbf{p} = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 1 \\ 0 & 1 \\ 1 & 1 \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} -2 \\ 6 \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} 4 \\ 6 \\ 4 \end{bmatrix}.$$

The error is now given by

$$\mathbf{e} = \mathbf{b} - \mathbf{p} = \begin{bmatrix} 4 \\ 6 \\ 4 \end{bmatrix} - \begin{bmatrix} 4 \\ 6 \\ 4 \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} 0 \\ 0 \\ 0 \end{bmatrix}.$$

Obviously  $\mathbf{e}$  is orthogonal to the columns of  $\mathbf{A}$ . Note that actually  $\mathbf{b} \in \mathcal{C}(\mathbf{A})$  because

$$\begin{bmatrix} 4 \\ 6 \\ 4 \end{bmatrix} = -2 \begin{bmatrix} 1 \\ 0 \\ 1 \end{bmatrix} + 6 \begin{bmatrix} 1 \\ 1 \\ 1 \end{bmatrix}.$$

Hence projecting  $\mathbf{b}$  onto  $\mathcal{C}(\mathbf{A})$  results in  $\mathbf{b}$  itself.

6. (a) In class we know the projection matrix projecting a vector onto the column space of  $\mathbf{A}$  is given by

$$\mathbf{P} = \mathbf{A}(\mathbf{A}^T \mathbf{A})^{-1} \mathbf{A}^T \quad (4)$$

where  $\mathbf{A}$  is assumed to have full column rank so that  $(\mathbf{A}^T \mathbf{A})^{-1}$  exists.

Unfortunately, the matrix

$$\mathbf{A} = \begin{bmatrix} 2 & 4 & 4 \\ 5 & 10 & 10 \end{bmatrix}$$

does not have full column rank because its columns are linearly dependent. As a result we cannot apply (4) directly. However, a closer look at  $\mathbf{A}$  reveals that its column space is actually spanned by a single vector, say

$$\mathbf{v}_C = \begin{bmatrix} 2 \\ 5 \end{bmatrix}.$$

Since  $\mathbf{v}_C$  has full column rank, we may apply (4) and obtain

$$\mathbf{P}_C = \begin{bmatrix} 2 \\ 5 \end{bmatrix} \cdot \frac{1}{29} \cdot [2 \ 5] = \begin{bmatrix} 4/29 & 10/29 \\ 10/29 & 25/29 \end{bmatrix}.$$

- (b) Let  $\mathbf{B} \triangleq \mathbf{A}^T = \begin{bmatrix} 2 & 5 \\ 4 & 10 \\ 4 & 10 \end{bmatrix}$  so that  $\mathcal{C}(\mathbf{A}^T) = \mathcal{C}(\mathbf{B})$ . Since the column space of

$\mathbf{B}$  is spanned by a single vector  $\mathbf{v}_R = \begin{bmatrix} 2 \\ 4 \\ 4 \end{bmatrix}$ , we may apply (4) to obtain

$$\mathbf{P}_R = \begin{bmatrix} 2 \\ 4 \\ 4 \end{bmatrix} \cdot \frac{1}{36} \cdot [2 \ 4 \ 4] = \begin{bmatrix} 1/9 & 2/9 & 2/9 \\ 2/9 & 4/9 & 4/9 \\ 2/9 & 4/9 & 4/9 \end{bmatrix}.$$

After some calculations we discover that

$$\mathbf{P}_C \mathbf{A} \mathbf{P}_R = \begin{bmatrix} 2 & 4 & 4 \\ 5 & 10 & 10 \end{bmatrix} = \mathbf{A}.$$

This result follows from the facts that

$$\mathbf{P}_C \mathbf{A} = \mathbf{A} \quad \text{and} \quad \mathbf{A} \mathbf{P}_R = \mathbf{A}.$$

To explain why, we let  $\mathbf{x}$  be a vector. Since  $\mathbf{A}\mathbf{x} \in \mathcal{C}(\mathbf{A})$  and  $\mathbf{A}^T \mathbf{x} \in \mathcal{C}(\mathbf{A}^T)$ , it follows that

$$(\mathbf{P}_C \mathbf{A})\mathbf{x} = \mathbf{P}_C(\mathbf{A}\mathbf{x}) = \mathbf{A}\mathbf{x}$$

and

$$(\mathbf{P}_R^T \mathbf{A}^T)\mathbf{x} = \mathbf{P}_R^T(\mathbf{A}^T \mathbf{x}) = \mathbf{P}_R(\mathbf{A}^T \mathbf{x}) = \mathbf{A}^T \mathbf{x}.$$

Since  $\mathbf{x}$  is arbitrary, we must have

$$\mathbf{P}_C \mathbf{A} = \mathbf{A} \quad \text{and} \quad \mathbf{P}_R^T \mathbf{A}^T = \mathbf{A}^T \quad (\text{or } \mathbf{A} \mathbf{P}_R = \mathbf{A}).$$

Using these two facts, we may obtain

$$\mathbf{P}_C \mathbf{A} \mathbf{P}_R = (\mathbf{P}_C \mathbf{A}) \mathbf{P}_R = \mathbf{A} \mathbf{P}_R = \mathbf{A}.$$

7. (a) Let

$$\mathbf{A}_1 \triangleq \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 0 & 0 \\ 1 & 1 & 1 \\ 1 & 3 & 9 \\ 1 & 4 & 16 \end{bmatrix}, \quad \hat{\mathbf{x}}_1 \triangleq \begin{bmatrix} C_1 \\ D_1 \\ E_1 \end{bmatrix}, \quad \text{and} \quad \mathbf{b}_1 \triangleq \begin{bmatrix} 0 \\ 8 \\ 8 \\ 20 \end{bmatrix}.$$

In class we learn the choice of  $\hat{\mathbf{x}}_1$  which minimizes  $\|\mathbf{e}\|^2$  is given by solving

$$\mathbf{A}_1^T \mathbf{A}_1 \hat{\mathbf{x}}_1 = \mathbf{A}_1^T \mathbf{b}_1$$

which yields

$$\begin{bmatrix} 4 & 8 & 26 \\ 8 & 26 & 92 \\ 26 & 92 & 338 \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} C_1 \\ D_1 \\ E_1 \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} 36 \\ 112 \\ 400 \end{bmatrix}.$$

Therefore,

$$\hat{\mathbf{x}}_1 = \begin{bmatrix} C_1 \\ D_1 \\ E_1 \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} 2 \\ 4/3 \\ 2/3 \end{bmatrix}.$$

The closest parabola is hence  $b = 2 + (4/3)t + (2/3)t^2$ . The projection of  $\mathbf{b}_1$  onto  $\mathcal{C}(\mathbf{A}_1)$  is

$$\mathbf{p}_1 = \mathbf{A}_1 \hat{\mathbf{x}}_1 = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 0 & 0 \\ 1 & 1 & 1 \\ 1 & 3 & 9 \\ 1 & 4 & 16 \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} 2 \\ 4/3 \\ 2/3 \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} 2 \\ 4 \\ 12 \\ 18 \end{bmatrix}.$$

Finally, the error is given by

$$\mathbf{e}_1 = \mathbf{b}_1 - \mathbf{p}_1 = \begin{bmatrix} 0 \\ 8 \\ 8 \\ 20 \end{bmatrix} - \begin{bmatrix} 2 \\ 4 \\ 12 \\ 18 \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} -2 \\ 4 \\ -4 \\ 2 \end{bmatrix}$$

with  $\|\mathbf{e}_1\|^2 = (-2)^2 + 4^2 + (-4)^2 + 2^2 = 40$ .

(b) Computations similar to part (a) can be carried out by letting

$$\mathbf{A}_2 \triangleq \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 1 & 1 & 1 & 1 \\ 1 & 3 & 9 & 27 \\ 1 & 4 & 16 & 64 \end{bmatrix}, \quad \hat{\mathbf{x}}_2 \triangleq \begin{bmatrix} C_2 \\ D_2 \\ E_2 \\ F_2 \end{bmatrix}, \quad \text{and} \quad \mathbf{b}_2 \triangleq \begin{bmatrix} 0 \\ 8 \\ 8 \\ 20 \end{bmatrix}.$$

However, there is no need for such amount of computation in this problem! A simple check will confirm that the columns of  $\mathbf{A}_2$  are linearly independent. Hence  $\mathcal{C}(\mathbf{A}_2) = \mathcal{R}^4$ . Now since  $\mathbf{b}_2 \in \mathcal{R}^4 = \mathcal{C}(\mathbf{A}_2)$ , we should be able to fit a curve without any error! The exact coefficients of the curve can be determined by solving

$$\mathbf{A}_2 \hat{\mathbf{x}}_2 = \mathbf{b}_2$$

or equivalently,

$$\begin{bmatrix} 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 1 & 1 & 1 & 1 \\ 1 & 3 & 9 & 27 \\ 1 & 4 & 16 & 64 \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} C_2 \\ D_2 \\ E_2 \\ F_2 \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} 0 \\ 8 \\ 8 \\ 20 \end{bmatrix}.$$

Applying elimination yields

$$\hat{\mathbf{x}}_2 = \begin{bmatrix} C_2 \\ D_2 \\ E_2 \\ F_2 \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} 0 \\ 47/3 \\ -28/3 \\ 5/3 \end{bmatrix}.$$

Therefore, the closest cubic is given by  $b = (47/3)t - (28/3)t^2 + (5/3)t^3$ . The error in this case is of course

$$\mathbf{e}_2 = \mathbf{b}_2 - \mathbf{p}_2 = \mathbf{b}_2 - \mathbf{b}_2 = \mathbf{0} \quad \text{with} \quad \|\mathbf{e}_2\|^2 = 0.$$

8. (a) Let  $\mathbf{y} \triangleq \mathbf{A}\mathbf{x}$  and  $\mathbf{z} \triangleq \mathbf{A}^T\mathbf{y}$ . Since

$$\frac{\partial}{\partial x_k} \|\mathbf{A}\mathbf{x}\|^2 = \frac{\partial}{\partial x_k} \|\mathbf{y}\|^2 = \frac{\partial}{\partial x_k} \sum_{i=1}^m y_i^2 = \sum_{i=1}^m 2y_i \frac{\partial y_i}{\partial x_k}$$

and

$$\frac{\partial y_i}{\partial x_k} = \frac{\partial}{\partial x_k} \sum_{j=1}^n A_{ij}x_j = A_{ik} = A_{ki}^T$$

we have

$$\frac{\partial}{\partial x_k} \|\mathbf{Ax}\|^2 = 2 \sum_{i=1}^m A_{ki}^T y_i = 2z_k.$$

Collecting the partial derivatives yields

$$\begin{bmatrix} \frac{\partial}{\partial x_1} \|\mathbf{Ax}\|^2 \\ \vdots \\ \frac{\partial}{\partial x_n} \|\mathbf{Ax}\|^2 \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} 2z_1 \\ \vdots \\ 2z_n \end{bmatrix} = 2\mathbf{z} = 2\mathbf{A}^T \mathbf{y} = 2\mathbf{A}^T \mathbf{Ax}.$$

(b) Let  $\mathbf{w} \triangleq \mathbf{A}^T \mathbf{b}$ ; then we have

$$\frac{\partial}{\partial x_k} (2\mathbf{b}^T \mathbf{Ax}) = \frac{\partial}{\partial x_k} \left( 2 \sum_{i=1}^m b_i y_i \right) = 2 \sum_{i=1}^m A_{ki}^T b_i = 2w_k.$$

Collecting the partial derivatives yields

$$\begin{bmatrix} \frac{\partial}{\partial x_1} (2\mathbf{b}^T \mathbf{Ax}) \\ \vdots \\ \frac{\partial}{\partial x_n} (2\mathbf{b}^T \mathbf{Ax}) \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} 2w_1 \\ \vdots \\ 2w_n \end{bmatrix} = 2\mathbf{w} = 2\mathbf{A}^T \mathbf{b}.$$

(c) Finally, we obtain

$$\frac{\partial}{\partial x_k} \|\mathbf{Ax} - \mathbf{b}\|^2 = \frac{\partial}{\partial x_k} \|\mathbf{Ax}\|^2 - \frac{\partial}{\partial x_k} (2\mathbf{b}^T \mathbf{Ax}) = 2z_k - 2w_k.$$

Collecting the partial derivatives yields

$$\begin{bmatrix} \frac{\partial}{\partial x_1} \|\mathbf{Ax} - \mathbf{b}\|^2 \\ \vdots \\ \frac{\partial}{\partial x_n} \|\mathbf{Ax} - \mathbf{b}\|^2 \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} 2z_1 - 2w_1 \\ \vdots \\ 2z_n - 2w_n \end{bmatrix} = 2(\mathbf{z} - \mathbf{w}) = 2(\mathbf{A}^T \mathbf{Ax} - \mathbf{A}^T \mathbf{b}).$$

Hence the partial derivatives of  $\|\mathbf{Ax} - \mathbf{b}\|^2$  are zero when  $\mathbf{A}^T \mathbf{Ax} = \mathbf{A}^T \mathbf{b}$ .